

# Canal Winchester

*City Hall  
45 East Waterloo Street  
Canal Winchester, OH 43110*



## Meeting Minutes

**May 22, 2023**

**7:00 PM**

## Landmarks Commission

*Pete Lynch – Chairman  
David Craycraft – Vice-Chairman  
Rich Dobda – Secretary  
Roger White  
Dr. Scott Kelly  
Whit Wardell  
Linda Boving*

Call To Order

*Time In: 7:00pm*

Declaring A Quorum (Roll Call)

**A motion was made by Roger White, seconded by David Craycraft, that Rich Dobda be excused.**

**The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Yes: 6** – Linda Boving, Peter Lynch Roger White, David Craycraft, Whit Wardell & Dr. Scott Kelly

Approval of Minutes

April 24, 2023 Landmarks Commission Meeting Minutes

**A motion was made by David Craycraft, seconded by Dr. Scott Kelly, that the April 24, 2023 Minutes be approved.**

**The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Yes: 6** – Linda Boving, Peter Lynch Roger White, David Craycraft, Whit Wardell & Dr. Scott Kelly

Pending Applications

*\*Member Rich Dobda jointed the meeting.*

**CA-23-017**

Property Owner: John & Janic Kantner  
Applicant: Travis Ketron  
Location: 42 West Columbus Street  
Request: New Fence Design

Mr. Moore presented the application for Travis Ketron for property located at 42 West Columbus Street. The applicant is requesting approval for the design of a new fence that was constructed along Liberty Street side of the property. The fence style was changed with the project for the in-ground swimming pool and pavilion. This change in style did not receive prior approval from the Landmarks Commission.

Mr. Craycraft asked the applicant the reasoning to go with the horizontal slat design. The applicant noted it was their clients request. They constructed a new swimming pool and wanted to change the design for additional privacy.

Dr. Kelly asked the applicant if all three sides of fencing on this property are the same. The applicant indicated that they are not. The rear elevation is a 6 foot privacy fence in a vertical orientation. Dr. Kelly asked if they intended on updating that fence to match this one. The applicant indicated they did not. The preexisting design the two fence designs did not match.

Dr. Kelly noted that it looks like the slats on the fence along the alley are tight together. The applicant affirmed.

Mr. Lynch noted that the fence that was removed was similar to the style as the fence along the alley. Main difference being it was more open with gaps in the slats and shorter in height. The applicant affirmed it went from privacy to semi private.

Mr. Craycraft asked if the new fence is 6 foot in height all the way across the yard now. The applicant affirmed.

Mr. Lynch asked the applicant if there was any discussion on matching the two sides of the fence. The applicant indicated the client just wanted to change the Liberty Street side to a horizontal slat design.

Mr. Lynch asked staff if in 2021 when the pool was approved was there any discussion on the fence design. Staff noted that the plans stated the fence was to remain as-is.

Dr. Kelly asked if the fence would remain natural. The applicant affirmed.

Mr. Craycraft noted that he likes the style of the rear fence that they originally approved. It has privacy with the tight boards and is 6 foot high. Mr. Lynch affirmed stating that it would be nice if the two designs matched.

Mr. Lynch asked if the fence is permitted to be 6 foot tall in the existing location. Staff affirmed.

Mr. Lynch discussed his concern with the design of the new fence and that it is not historically appropriate for the design of the home. If the fence kept the same style as the one along the alley, there would be no issues with it.

Mr. White asked if there is any internal support on the horizontal boards to keep them from warping. The applicant indicated there is not, as the posts are a little less than an 8 foot span.

Mr. Lynch noted with a 6 foot tall fence at 8 foot span it is possible to rotate the boards 90 degrees to reuse the existing lumber to have the design match the fence along the alley. If the fence that was installed was submitted for review, Lynch noted he would not have voted to approve it.

Mr. Ketron asked the commission if there is a criteria for fence styles. Mr. Lynch noted that they look at what is appropriate given the context of the home and the historical character of the requested design. The applicant noted that there are historical vertical fence designs. Mr. Lynch noted they are not typical in Canal Winchester.

Staff asked the commission if it would make a difference in this application if both styles were the same design to make it consistent. The applicant noted that either fence could be modified and it would be about the same level of effort, but the client is leaning towards the horizontal design.

Mr. Lynch asked what fence type is on the east property line. Staff indicated that is the neighbors fence and it is a 6 foot dog ear privacy design.

Mr. Craycraft noted he prefers the fence on the rear alley. Mr. Lynch affirmed. Craycraft added he is not a fan of this particular style in this neighborhood.

**A motion was made by Peter Lynch, seconded by David Craycraft that Certificate of Appropriateness #CA-23-017 be approved with the following condition:**

**1) The fence facing Liberty Street to be modified to match the design of the fence facing the alley to the north.**

**The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Yes: 7** – Linda Boving, Peter Lynch Roger White, David Craycraft, Rich Dobda, Whit Wardell & Dr. Scott Kelly

**CA-23-018**

Property Owner: Don Miller  
Applicant: Don Miller  
Location: 185 Washington Street  
Request: New Metal Roof and Gutters

Mr. Moore presented the application for Don Miller for property located at 185 Washington Street. The applicant is requesting approval for a new standing seam metal roof and K-style gutters on the single-family home. Staff presented the brief history of the property, noting all of the different roof styles it has had over the years. The applicant is requesting to replace the existing asphalt shingles with a new double lock standing seam metal roof in the color 'Medium Bronze'. The new gutters will replace the existing copper half-round style and will be 'Jefferson Tan' in color to match the other trim on the home.

Mr. Craycraft asked the applicant if the metal roof on the rear of the home would be replaced with a new 'medium bronze' color to match. The applicant affirmed.

Mr. Lynch asked if the existing gutters are half-round design. The applicant affirmed noting that they are switching to a conventional style as the only way to hang the half-rounds is through the roof with straps. Lynch asked if they are unable to fasten the gutters under the metal. The applicant affirmed.

Mr. Lynch asked if the copper downspouts would remain. The applicant noted those are to be removed as well and be replaced in the color 'Jefferson Tan'.

Mr. Lynch asked if the gutter contractor discussed any options for mounting the gutters other than the overlay strap. The applicant noted they did not.

Mr. Miller stated it would be nice to use the half-rounds but they are not adequate. Mr. Lynch asked if they are 4" and the applicant affirmed.

Mr. Craycraft asked if by not adequate the applicant was referring to overflow with the gutters. The applicant affirmed. Mr. Lynch added that it is a fast roof with the pitch and its about to get faster with it being all metal.

Mrs. Miller stated that the gutters on the home are not contiguous and there are lots of seams that drip. A new gutter type would be on piece and not leak.

Dr. Kelly noted he has a continuous design half-round gutter on his home. Mr. Lynch noted there are 6" gutters that help capture more water and that would be a more appropriate size for this home.

Mr. Miller responded that he thinks it is hard mounting a half-round style. Mr. Lynch noted there is a dish product that cradles the gutter that mounts directly to the soffit.

Mr. Lynch asked if only the two elevations are getting new gutters. The applicant affirmed noting the side porch to the north has a newer style gutter that will remain.

Dr. Kelly asked why the gutters are being switched to the lighter color from what is there now. Mrs. Miller noted that they drove around and looked at other brick historical homes in Columbus and most of them had gutters that matched the trim color on the home with the soffit and windows.

Staff asked the applicant if they are installing snow breaks with the new roof. The applicant affirmed.

Mrs. Miller noted that this home had a wood shake roof on it originally. When they first purchased the home they pulled the metal roof off and put a wood shake roof back on it but it did not hold up. After the shake they did asphalt shingles. Now they are looking to go back to a really nice metal product, like when they first purchased the property. This may not be the original style, but its very early to the home.

Mr. Lynch asked the applicant if the fascia is pitched or perpendicular to the ground. The applicant noted it is pitched. Lynch stated that he thinks a 6" half-round will be charming on this home and would be more appropriate sizing. A good company will run a continuous half-round gutter without seams.

Mr. Miller asked if they get the roof and conventional style gutters approved tonight, could they go with a half-round at a different time. Staff noted that if they wanted to change the design to half-round later, they would need to reapply unless the commission approves both gutter options.

Mr. Lynch noted in his experience, the half-round gutter is about 15% more than the k-style. Mr. Miller asked if those are galvanized. Mr. Lynch affirmed and stated they are typically pre-painted. DMI will roll out the same metal right on their truck.

Mr. Miller asked if they have the correct hangers for the installation. Mr. Lynch stated that concealed hangers do exist with a cradle product.

Mrs. Miller discussed her concern with a time constraint with getting it done this year.

Mr. Miller noted that Newman roof priced the gutters high but they know they can get it done in a better price.

Mr. Lynch noted that for this home, a half-round style like what is on the home now would look better in the end.

Mr. Miller asked if they can get a gutter guard for a half-round product. The commission noted they are not sure how that product is different.

Mr. Miller asked if the half-round comes in color choices like the k-style. The commission affirmed.

Mr. Miller noted that while half-round was not something they planned on doing, it may look better on the home. That is up to the Landmarks Commission.

The commission noted they feel the half-round is a better choice in this application. Mr. Lynch noted that with a brick house having so many square edges, a round gutter standing off the brick adds dimension as well.

Mr. Miller asked if they could keep the existing copper gutters instead of installing new 6" half-rounds would that be an option. The commission noted that would be an option as the gutters that are on the home now are really nice.

**A motion was made by David Craycraft, seconded by Whit Wardell that Certificate of Appropriateness #CA-23-018 be approved with the following condition:**

**1) If the copper half-round gutters are to be removed, they be replaced with 6" half-round gutters in Jefferson Tan to match the building trim.**

**The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Yes: 7** – Linda Boving, Peter Lynch Roger White, David Craycraft, Rich Dobda, Whit Wardell & Dr. Scott Kelly

**CA-23-019**

Property Owner: Brian & Ashley Vance  
Applicant: Brian & Ashley Vance  
Location: 43 East Columbus Street  
Request: Front Porch Modifications

Staff noted that the applicant requested this application be tabled to the June agenda as they had a conflict on attending the meeting.

**CA-23-020**

Property Owner: Cindy Kolecki  
Applicant: Chuck O’Niel - Nature View Exteriors  
Location: 153 Washington Street  
Request: New Deck

Mr. Moore presented the application for Steve & Cindy Kolecki for property located at 153 Washington Street. The applicant is requesting approval to construct a new 10x12 oval deck at the rear of the property. Staff noted that the proposed deck is shown as a Trex composite decking with an aluminum railing. The deck is shown on the other side of the outdoor fireplace at the end of the patio area.

Mr. Craycraft asked how wide the Trex boards will be. Mr. Kolecki noted they are 6” in width and will match the color and style of the back patio area.

Staff asked if the support under the deck would be visible. The applicant noted that the deck would have a skirting to be made out of the Trex material.

Mrs. Kolecki noted there is a step on the south side of the deck down to grade.

Mr. Kolecki noted that the drawings don’t show it, but there is a opening on the north side of the deck that will connect to the existing walkway.

**A motion was made by David Craycraft, seconded by Peter Lynch, to approve Certificate of Appropriateness #CA-23-020 as presented.**

**The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Yes: 7** – Linda Boving, Peter Lynch Roger White, David Craycraft, Rich Dobda, Whit Wardell & Dr. Scott Kelly

Old Business

Staff talked about the Landmarks appeal for 109 Park Street and the City Council Committee of the Whole meeting coming up next week.

The commission discussed value in refreshing their knowledge of the Old Town Guidelines.

The commission discussed the value in enforcing the Landmarks Commission and how long a property owner has to make corrections before enforcement measures are taken. Staff noted that the Certificate of Appropriateness is valid for 1 year, so that is the general timeframe they have to complete a project before it expires.

Mrs. Boving asked what rules differ between the Historic and Preservation District. Staff indicated that in Historic District you need approval for paint colors and are required to use natural materials. In the preservation district paint colors do not matter and are highly recommended to use natural materials, but other materials can be used at the discretion of the Commission.

Staff noted that ideally after the Community Plan is adopted the zoning code will be updated to reflect goals in the Plan and the Old Town Guidelines could be revisited.

Mr. Lynch noted he is disappointed in the number of applications this year that have been after the project has been completed for a forgiveness scenario, especially from people who should know better. The commission affirmed noting that an enforcement division would be helpful in this instance.

New Business

Adjournment

*Time Out: 8:03pm*

**A motion was made by David Craycraft, seconded by Peter Lynch, that this meeting be adjourned.**

**The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Yes: 7** – Linda Boving, Peter Lynch Roger White, David Craycraft, Rich Dobda, Whit Wardell & Dr. Scott Kelly

---

Date

---

Landmarks Chairman